

**POLITICAL ADVOCACY AND OUTREACH SUPPORT FOR
TRANSFORMING EDUCATION
IN PAKISTAN (TEP)
PHASE-II**

**Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue on
Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh
28th January 2014**

Proceeding/Report of Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue - Sindh



**Institute of
Social and Policy Sciences**



Table of Contents

Acronyms.....	1
Context and Background.....	2
Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue	2
Proceedings of the Dialogue	3
Registration of the Participants	3
Recitation of the Holy Quran and Welcome Note	3
Presentation on Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue on Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh.....	3
Discussion Highlights	4
Vote of Thanks.....	6
Annex I- Picture Gallery	7
Annex II-Media Coverage	8
Annex III - List of Participants	13
Annex IV - Program.....	15

Acronyms

I-SAPS	Institute Of Social And Policy Sciences
MPA	Member Provincial Assembly
MQM	Muttahida Quami Movement
PML (F)	Pakistan Muslim League Functional
PPPP	Pakistan People's Party Parliamentarians

Context and Background

Institute of Social and Policy Sciences (I-SAPS) is working in collaboration with Alif Ailaan to help tackle education emergency in Pakistan. The initiative is based upon the fact that the role of political leadership and their commitment is fundamental in addressing the challenges of access to quality education for all. With this reference political parties and their leadership are the essential means for shaping, influencing and directing the process of education reforms. There is a need to increase the ‘political capital’ that has stake in education reforms. Also, the focus of the initiative is to inform and sensitize the politicians, political parties, opinion leaders, local councilors and all those who have a stake in the politics through evidence-based advocacy for transforming education and to deliver right to education provided by Article 25a of the Constitution of Pakistan. Within this backdrop, the joint initiative of I-SAPS and Alif Ailaan in undertaking continuous engagement with wide stakeholders through and evidence-based political advocacy.

Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue

Considering the importance of financing in education, the initiative also focuses on improving its effectiveness of education financing in its respective provinces. I-SAPS has undertaken public finance analysis and conducting policy advocacy through dialogues and consultations with a view to contributing towards system and process improvement by providing evidence-base and informed policy options.

To initiate an informed discourse with relevant stakeholders, the pre-budget policy dialogue has been organized in Karachi, Sindh to deliberate upon the critical relevance of resource allocation to education quality and accessibility especially focusing at provincial level in Sindh. The dialogue intended to provide informed policy options and recommendations for improved allocations for public sector allocations and to suggest ways for effective utilization of available resources.

An analysis of education budgets of the province of Sindh shows that about one fourth of the total provincial budget is absorbed in education related expenses. A breakdown of the share of education in the total provincial outlay suggests that 33 percent and 7 percent of the provincial current and development outlay, respectively, has been allocated for education. The total provincial outlay in 2013-14 was Rs. 585.91 billion out of which Rs. 135.55 billion (23 percent) has been allocated for education budget. This amount includes education budget of districts as well. Out of this total allocation, Rs. 118.66 billion (88 percent) will be absorbed in recurrent expenses. 79 percent of the recurrent budget will go to salaries and other employee-related expenses such as pay and allowances. An amount of Rs. 16.89 billion (6.6 per cent) is allocated for development schemes which is an increase of 243 per cent compared to the actual expenditure in 2012-13. Although, there has been substantial increase in percentage terms, such low share of development expenditure in the provincial education budget shows lack of commitment of the Government to improve the infrastructure and facilities provided to schools.

Besides, persisting issues in adequate need-based allocation and utilization of budget, the new developments in the wake of 18th Constitutional Amendment and particularly insertion of Article 25-A has thrown new opportunities and challenges for education sector. There is a need

to have informed debate on the required financial outlay and legal requirements in order to be compliant with the constitution.

The Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue on Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh was undertaken to inform the key stakeholders about the above mentioned issues. The objective of the dialogue was to share an analysis of provincial education budget trends for the fiscal year 2013-14 and to initiate the process of informed deliberations to facilitate improvement in public allocations and spending on education. The dialogue also highlighted opportunities and challenges for education sector emerging after the 18th Constitutional Amendment for Sindh.

The broad aim of this dialogue was to facilitate the informed debate on education budget in order to improve allocation education budgets for the year 2014-15. Specific objectives of policy dialogue were as follows:

- i. Provide the much needed interface between government officials, public representatives and civil society for improving the effectiveness of resource allocations and spending in the education sector along with a critical revisit of the associated governance issues;
- ii. Proposed set of recommendations for effective and appropriate budget allocations by relevant education departments in the province.

Proceedings of the Dialogue

Registration of the Participants

The participants were welcomed and registered by Mr. Mukhtiar Zour District Coordinator I-SAPS Karachi.

Recitation of the Holy Quran and Welcome Note

The program was started with the verses of Holy Quran by Mr. Waheed and Ms. Sumaira Amir Khan from I-SAPS welcomed the participants and gave brief introduction about Alif Ailaan and I-SAPS joint mandate on the project (Access of Quality Education through Political Voice in Pakistan).

Presentation on Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue on Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh

Mr. Ahmad Ali Research Fellow at I-SAPS gave an inclusive presentation about the Provincial Budget of financial year 2013-14. It was further discussed that the situation of education in Sindh is not significant; overall the province lacks the required number of schools, teachers, missing facilities and teachers' training. He explained the major issues regarding budget allocation and its expenditure to the participants and opened the forum for question answers and suggestions for improving the Sindh education budget.

Discussion Highlights

All the participants took an active part in the discussion and raised many important questions and also recommended the considerable suggestions.

Dr. Sajid Ali

**Assistant Professor & Coordinator Doctoral Programme, Institute for Education
Development Agha Khan University**

Dr. Sajid Ali appreciated the initiative took by I-SAPS and Alif Ailaan jointly for providing the interface between government officials, public representatives and civil society for improving the effectiveness of resource allocations and spending in the education sector. He also showed concerns regarding the missing facilities and financial model for the proper allocations of budget for education and its expenditure.

He also mentioned that the Sindh education plan was a joint effort but was not taken up seriously for the international grant and its implementation. He also demanded for the specifically allocated budget for research purpose for research institutes/ organizations which he said is most important for advancement in the scientific field.

Sadiqa Sallahudin

Executive Director, Indus Resource Centre

Ms. Sadiqa presented the view that the teachers allocation for the primary schools should be from the same area and local female teachers can be allocated for the co-education schools at primary level. She also discussed the need of teachers' training and transparent induction of teachers and highlighted the fact that all inductions should be transparent and merit based.

Aijaz Ali Khuwaja

Managing Director, Sehatmand Sindh

Mr. Aijaz discussed the recent scenario and told the participants that there are 73 lac out of school children which is of deep concern but there is no information that where they are and what they do. He also mentioned that 800 schools are closed in Thatta, out of 426 teachers only 15-20 teachers present in schools others are ghost teachers and also emphasize on the presence of teachers is made mandatory.

Idrees Chandio

Information Secretary, Sindh United Party

Information Minister, Sindh United Party Mr. Idrees discussed his visits to 400 union councils of Sindh and mentioned that the budget allocated is enough but its proper expenditure for the development and teachers' training is required. Importance of teachers training at district level and divisional computerized data base was also part of the discussion. He also mentioned the need of removing the bribery and discrimination from the system and demanded for the transparency in education system.

Shireen Rehmatullah

President, Institute of Social Research

Ms. Shireen appreciated the joint efforts of I-SAPS and Alif Ailaan and also showed deep concern regarding the present situation of education in the province. She highlighted the importance of handing over the data analysis and planning to the planning department. She said that an analysis should be conducted to analyze that why 60% children of age 11 are out of schools and asked for joint efforts of civil society and communities to participate in the process of improving the dropout and educational system. She also suggested that text book reforms must be the part of the policy and preference should also be given to the medium of instruction that should be English and also health education should be part of the education.

Perspectives of the Key Speakers

Sardar Mohammad Ahmad

Member Provincial Assembly, Muttahida Quami Movement (MQM)

Mr. Ahmad highlighted the issues faced by the province in the recent situation of all law and governance. He also said that educational standard and provision of quality education must be made available for all equally and proper expenditure of allocated budget must be done. He also asked for the contribution by the standing committees and civil society organizations that will also speed up the process.

Nusrat Sehar Abbasi

Member Provincial Assembly, Pakistan Muslim League Functional (PML-F)

Ms. Nusrat enlightened the need of data analysis constituency wise and policies for the disaster effected schools. She also demanded the government for the fair and transparent inductions of teachers on the merit and it should be taken to the assembly floor by the politicians. She said that all the issues discussed and highlighted in the presentation are of deep concern for their political party. She said that I will take the personal responsibility to take up all these issues at the floor of the assembly and will also undertake measures to work with all interested parties on the resolution of the issues highlighted.

Rehana Laghari

Member Provincial Assembly, Pakistan People's Party Parliamentarians (PPPP)

Ms. Laghari emphasized on the positive perspectives of the work done in the province and also asked to mention the closed schools and objected the un-ethical behavior of the teachers towards students that she mentioned is another reason of school dropout. She also demanded for the reconstruction of the flood effected schools in Sindh. She also demanded for the missing facilities to be made available. She said that she is ready to provide all the support to I-SAPS and Alif Ailaan teams.

Kareem Khawaja
Senator, Pakistan People's Party

Mr. Karim Khwaja thanked I-SAPS and Alif Ailaan for inviting him to the important event. He said that the discussed issues in the forum are of utmost importance. He said that his political party has taken up a number of initiatives for improving the situation of education. However, he has taken a serious note of all the issues highlighted in the presentation. He further said that he will communicate all the highlights of the issues with the education minister and they will take corrective actions for improving this situation.

Vote of Thanks

At the end of the policy dialogue, Mr. Ahmad Ali thanked the participants for attending and taking part in discussion.

Annex I- Picture Gallery



Annex II-Media Coverage











Seminar on Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh held

By Ghulam Fareed Memon

SUJAWAL: A seminar on Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh was held by Institute of Social & Policy Science in collaboration with Alf Ailan in a local hotel of Mirpur Bathoro here on Friday.

PPP leader Senator Dr Abdul Karim Khuwaja, MQM's Syed Sardar Ahmed, PML-F's Nusrat Sehar Abbasi, PPP's Rehana Laghari Sumera Amir Khan of Racers Fellow, ISRD President Shireen Rehmat, NCHD's Madame Humera Hashmi, Alf Ailan's Samar Naz and others addressed the seminar. While briefing the participants of the seminar, Mr. Ahmed Ali said that more than 7.3 million children are out of schools, while 8192 schools are

deprived of buildings. He also expressed concerns over dilapidated condition of 6404 school buildings in the province of Sindh. He said that according to Article 25-A the children under 15 years of age will be provided free of cost education in 2015 and more than 4016 schools will be constructed across the province.

Speaking on the occasion, PPP Senator Dr Abdul Karim Khuwaja said that briefed has disappointed them and they will work for the betterment of education sector in the province. He said that children in schools will also be provided meals like seminaries. He also lauded the efforts of Institute of Social & Policy Science and Alf Ailan for promotion of education.

Annex III - List of Participants

S.No	Name	Designation	Organization
1	Rehana Laghari	MPA	PPPP
2	Nusrat Sehar Abbasi	MPA	PML (F)
3	Noman Tanvir	General Secretary	PML (N)
4	Ghulam Abbas Athar	President	PML (N)
5	Talib Hussain	Vice President Hyderabad	PML (N)
6	Muhammad Shareef	President Thatta	PML (N)
7	Sardar Mohammad Ahmed	MPA	MQM
8	Muhammad Arsalan Ghauri	Secretary Information Sindh	Jammat-e-Islami
9	Engr S.Lal	Vice President	Sindh United Party
10	Idrees Chandio	Information Secretary	Sindh United Party
11	Abdul Waheed Chandio	Sub Editor	Tameer-e-Sindh
12	Samar Naz	D & E Manager	Alif Ailaan
13	M.A. Abbasi	President	APWA
14	Muneer Aqeel Ansari	Reporter	Daily Jasarat Karachi
15	Yasir Shah	Reporter	Daily Jehan
16	M. Mustufain	Photographer	Daily Messenger
17	Salahuddin Ali	Reporter	Daily Nai Baat
18	Akber Ali Sajwani	Chief Reporter	Daily Shakti
19	Asif Ali Sheikh	Reporter	Daily Sindh Talks
20	Maqbool Rahu	Senior Manager Education	HANDS
21	Naseem Ahmed	Manager	HANDS
22	Shoaib Ahmed	Programme Assistant	HANDS
23	Sadiqa Salahuddin	Executive Director	Indus Resource Centre
24	Dr. Sajid Ali	Assistant Professor & Coordinator Doctoral Programme	Institute for Education Development Agha Khan University
25	Shireen Rehmatullah	President	Institute of Social Research
26	Muhammad Abbasi	Reporter	Mehran TV
27	Shahab Kazmi	Vice President	National Bank of Pakistan

S.No	Name	Designation	Organization
28	Zeeshan Khawaja	Project Manager	NCHD
29	Humaira Hashmi	Director Operations Sindh	NCHD
30	Muneer Ahmed	DGM	NCHD
31	Ghulam Nabi		NCHD
32	Ismail Memon	General Secretary	PDF Karachi
33	Dr. M.Ismail Memon	General Secretary	Peoples Doctor Forum karachi
34	Imran Zakir	Bureau Chief	PPA
35	Arbab Chandio	Reporter	Samaa TV
36	Aijaz Ali Khawaja	Managing Director	Sehatmand Sindh
37	Dr. Kareem A. Khawaja	Senator	Senate Pakistan
38	Muhammad Arsalan	Deputy Director	SF
39	Ghulam Nabi	Secretary/Councilor	Sindh Adabi Sngat
40	Jai Kumar	District President	Thatha
41	Madad Ali		
42	AbduL Waheed	Social Worker	
43	Naheed		
44	Fozia		
45	Ayaz Ali		

Annex IV - Program

Pre-Budget Policy Dialogue
on
‘Effectiveness of Education Financing in Sindh
organized by

Institute of Social and Policy Sciences (I-SAPS)

in collaboration with

Alif Ailaan

Tuesday, January 28, 2014 at Ball Room (B), Pearl Continental Hotel, Karachi

03: 00 p.m. Registration of the participants

03:30 p.m. Welcome Note

03:35-04:15 p.m. Presentations

03:35 – 03:45 p.m. Analysis of Sindh Education Budget 2013-14: Some Inferences

03:45 – 04:15 p.m. Article 25- A: Challenges and Opportunities for Sindh

04:35-05:25 pm Concluding Session

04:35 – 04:50 p.m. Remarks by the Guest of Honour
Fazlullah Pechuho
Secretary Education and Literacy, Sindh

04:35 – 04:50 p.m. Remarks by the Guest of Honour
Sharjeel Inam Memon, Information Minister, Sindh

04:35 – 04:50 p.m. Remarks by the Guest of Honour
Ms. Rehana Laghari, MPA

04:35 – 04:50 p.m. Remarks by the Guest of Honour
Jam Khan Shoro, MPA

05:00 – 05:20 p.m. Remarks by the Chair
Mr. Nisar Ahmad Khoro
Provincial Minister for Education and Literacy, Sindh

05:20 - 05:25 p.m. Vote of Thanks and Way Forward

05:25 pm Refreshments